

<b>TENDER EVALUATION REPORT</b>	<b>CATEGORY:</b>	Places - Property
	<b>INITIATIVE NUMBER &amp; TITLE:</b>	20-255 Maintenance and Reactive Repairs to Air Conditioning in Council Buildings
	<b>YORtender REF:</b>	DN516928
	<b>CATEGORY MANAGER:</b>	Annette Norfolk (Procurement Category Manager)
	<b>SERVICE LEAD:</b>	Stuart Carr (Facilities Manager)

## 1. PURPOSE

The purpose of this tender evaluation report is to provide Simon Moss, Assistant Director of Planning, Regeneration and Transport, with a summary of the procurement process undertaken for the maintenance and reactive repairs to air conditioning in council buildings, the outcomes achieved along with any potential issues and risks in order to seek approval to move to contract award.

## 2. OBJECTIVES OF RESULTANT AGREEMENT

The agreement is to appoint a suitably qualified organisation to provide services that meet the council's current requirement relating to the repair, service and maintenance of air conditioning plant located within a number of Council Buildings, as detailed within the Procurement Business Case, which was approved by Simon Moss (Assistant Director, Planning, Regeneration and Transport) on 19/03/2021.

## 3. KEY FACTS

<b>3.1</b>	Estimated Contract Value:	£205k based on historical spend over the previous 4 years
<b>3.2</b>	Initial Contract Term (months):	36 months
<b>3.3</b>	Extension Options (months):	1 x 12 month possible extension period
<b>3.4</b>	Route to Market:	Above threshold open procurement
<b>3.5</b>	Contract Notice Reference Number	021/S 000-005734

<b>3.6</b>	Tender Closing Date:	23/04/2021
<b>3.7</b>	Number of Expressions of Interest Received:	26
<b>3.8</b>	Number of Tenders Received:	14
<b>3.9</b>	Details of Formal Opt Outs:	<p>1 supplier provided no opt out reason.</p> <p>4 suppliers indicated that they were unable to be competitive</p> <p>4 suppliers indicated they had insufficient resources at this time.</p> <p>3 suppliers were unable to meet the timescales.</p>

## 4. EVALUATION

### 4.1 Evaluation Panel Members

Facilitator:	Annette Norfolk (Procurement Category Manager)		
Compliance Checks:	Annette Norfolk (Procurement Category Manager)		
Selection Criteria:	Annette Norfolk (Procurement Category Manager) Stuart Carr (Facilities Manager) Chris Southward (Senior Compliance Officer) Russ Phillips (Principal Building Services Manager)		
Award Criteria: Quality:	Stuart Carr (Facilities Manager) Chris Southward (Senior Compliance Officer) Russ Phillips (Principal Building Services Manager)		
Award Criteria: Social Value	The Social Value Portal verified by Annette Norfolk (Procurement Category Manager)		
Award Criteria: Price:	Annette Norfolk (Procurement Category Manager)		

### 4.2 Dates

Individual Evaluation:	26/04/2021	to	10/05/2021
Moderation:	11/05/2021	to	11/05/2021

## 4.3

## Summary Scores

Bidders Name	Compliance	Selection Criteria	Award Criteria				Total Score
			Mandatory Criteria	Quality Score (out of 40.00)	Social Value Score (out of 20.00)	Price Score (out of 40.00)	
Air Environmental Ltd	Pass	Pass	Pass	25.20	15.00	40.00	80.20
Airco Installations Ltd	Pass	Pass	Pass	30.40	2.89	32.29	65.58
Aircon Refrigeration	Pass	Pass	Pass	23.20	10.70	27.79	61.69
DFP Services Ltd	Pass	Pass	Pass	30.80	7.91	31.69	70.41
Lyndhurst Cooling and Heating Services	Pass	Pass	Pass	30.40	12.81	28.90	72.10
RSY Air Conditioning	Pass	Pass	Pass	8.00	8.09	28.71	44.80
H Clarke & Sons Ltd	Pass	Fail	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
J D Services HVAC Ltd	Pass	Fail	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Miramar Engineering Ltd	Pass	Fail	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Rocool HVAC Ltd	Pass	Fail	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Eon Controls Solutions	Fail	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
FEL Group Limited	Fail	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Force Contracts Ltd	Fail	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Machenair Ltd	Fail	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a

## 4.4

## Successful Bid(s) Details

Bidders Name:	Air Environmental Ltd
Proposed Contract Value:	The proposed contract value is in the region of £254k over the four years contract term, £95k of which are planned maintenance costs, with the remaining £159k relating to responsive call outs and repairs. There are a number of buildings currently under review which are expected to be removed from the property portfolio during 2021/22, which will result in a reduction in overall costs throughout the contract term.
<b>4.5 Due Diligence</b>	
<p>The outcome of the tender evaluation process resulted in Air Environmental Ltd being identified as the top scoring bidder. The Council has conducted due diligence utilising the following methods:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Credit safe check to ascertain the financial stability of the organisation, showing a satisfactory turnover and net worth.</li> <li>• Further compliance checks carried out to confirm professional memberships declared as part of the selection process, ie Gas Safe registration and CHAS accreditation, which were found to be correct.</li> <li>• Further clarification was sought relating to the provision of KPI's and monthly management information, with examples provided of suggested measurements.</li> </ul> <p>Following the due diligence undertaken, the evaluation panel are satisfied that the organisation fully understands the requirements and are capable of delivery. Although the Council will be entering into a new contractual agreement, the top scoring bidder is also the incumbent provider, who has carried out the servicing and maintenance on the Councils portfolio for the last 4 years, delivering an excellent service to the Council.</p>	

## 5 OUTCOMES ACHIEVED

As a result of this procurement exercise the Council will continue to work with the incumbent provider, Air Environmental Ltd, who are a Rotherham based SME. The estimated value of this procurement was over £100,000, therefore, to support the Council's Social Value policy, social value was included within the award criteria and as a result the Council has secured the following Social Value Commitments:

- The continuing employment of 3 FTE local fully trained air conditioning engineers plus 1 administrator for the full contract term of 36 months.
- Confirmation that all locally employed people will be paid in excess of the Joseph Rowntree Living Wage.
- 1 full time apprentice.
- 2 sessions per year dedicated to support young people into work relative to the HVAC industry
- 2 students will be offered 1 week unpaid work placements
- 2 persons offered a meaningful work placement each year for a 4 week period and paid at least the national minimum wage.
- A commitment to donate £250 per year of equipment and resources to local VCSE's
- A commitment to spend approximately £5300 per year on consumables and any

other required parts with suppliers based in Rotherham.

- Annual audits within the supply chain in order to identify and manage the risk of modern slavery occurring, plus the provision of an ethical procurement policy.
- All staff will be completing internal cyber security training in order to utilise the in-house management system which is an industry system which all staff need an individual licence to use.
- All fleet vehicles are Euro 6 compliant with emissions monitored and tracked by verilocation, details of which has been provided.

Commitment to recycle 100% of all plastic generated during the contract.

This is a substantial commitment and significant due diligence has taken place by RMBC and the Social Value Portal to ensure this offer is proportional and achievable. The contract manager within the service area will be responsible for supporting the supplier to achieve these commitments.

## 6 RISKS / ISSUES

The Covid-19 situation will continue to be monitored throughout the contract term to ensure all Covid-safe requirements are adhered to as well as following any local lockdown measures. No other risks have been identified; however ongoing regular contract management meetings will take place, facilitated, and managed by Facilities Management.

Recent experiences have highlighted the increasing risk of unsuccessful bidders formally complaining / challenging procurement decisions that are taken, which is a sign of the current economic climate. Whilst the evaluation panel are confident that the process undertaken is robust, there is the risk that unsuccessful bidders may raise issues around the decision, which will need to be satisfactorily addressed before we formally make the award and could therefore lengthen the timeline.

## 7 RECOMMENDATION

Following the evaluation for this tender it is the recommendation of the project team that the Council progresses to issue an intent to award to Air Environmental Ltd.

## 8 NEXT STEPS

Issue of intent to award 07/06/2021 and commence 10 day standstill period which would be due to expire on 17/06/2021. Contract to be added onto the forward plan and Officer Decision Report (ODR) to be completed by the Service Area. Following the satisfactory conclusion of standstill, the formal contract will be drafted and issued for signature to Simon Moss (Assistant Director; Planning, Regeneration and Transport) via DocuSign. It is anticipated that the contract will commence on 03/07/2021.

## 9 REPORT AUTHOR AND APPROVER

### 9.4 Report Author

Name: Annette Norfolk (Procurement Category Manager)

Date: 27/05/2021

### 9.5 Reviewed by Head of Procurement (or deputy)

Name: Joanne Kirk (Senior Procurement Category manager)

Date: 02/06/2021

### 9.6 Approver (approval obtained electronically)

Name: Simon Moss (Assistant Director – Planning, Regeneration & Transport)

Evidence: Embed a copy of the email approval

Date: 14/06/2021